

## Summary of the assessment of national guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) and disclosure systems for the purpose of decisions about the recognition of imported GO

On behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy

### Denmark



#### Introduction

The German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy (BMWi) and the German Federal Environment Agency (UBA) are currently assessing general questions on whether guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) from other Member States

of the European Union and further states can be recognized in the course of Article 15 of the Directive 2009/28/EC. The evaluation of the legal and practical set-up of the national systems for GO and electricity disclosure is performed by a consortium of external lawyers (Becker Büttner Held Rechtsanwälte (BBH)) and consultants (Öko-Institut e. V.).



#### General

As of 19.08.2014, assessment of available information regarding system-related issues does not result in well-founded doubts about accuracy, reliability or veracity of GO issued in and imported from Denmark, so that in accordance with Article 15 Directive 2009/28/EC, there seems to be no reason at present for non-recognition of such GO.

#### Specifics

Danish GO meet all the **criteria mentioned in Article 15 Directive 2009/28/EC**. According to the Regulation BEK 1323, they are issued for the standard size of 1 MWh and **used for electricity disclosure only**. Denmark uses – besides the electricity disclosure for renewable energy products – a “**general disclosure**” system, and the grid operator energinet.dk calculates and presents the national residual mix, but not the supplier mix. Although this is **not fully in line with the requirements in Article 3(9) Directive 2009/72/EC**, it seems to suffice to guarantee that there is **no doublecounting taking place**, and thus not to jeopardise the reliability of GO. One may also criticize that the Danish electricity disclosure system does not distinguish between waste and biomass/biogas, although waste may also contain non-biogenic substances. However, the **residual mix seems to be robust** and calculated based on the RE-DISS recommendations. It contains **only renewable electricity, the GO of which have expired**. GO and the residual mix are the only two ways to prove the origin of renewable electricity. Only for other energy sources than renewable energies other accounting methods, e.g. contract-based tracking, may be used. GO are **not used to meet the binding renewable energy targets** imposed by Article 3 Directive 2009/28/EC, neither do they impact the calculation of the gross energy consumption. According to the Regulation BEK 1323, they have to **be used within 12 months** after the end of the production period of the corresponding energy, which cannot be longer than one month (in case of longer metering intervals, the production is allocated to the respective months, either equally or according to the feed-in protocols).

The Regulation BEK 1323 as well as the EECS rules which are applied by

## Summary of the assessment of national guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) and disclosure systems for the purpose of decisions about the recognition of imported GO

On behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy

	<p>energinet.dk ensure that Danish GO can be <b>used only once</b>. The Danish grid operator energinet.dk is the <b>only competent body</b> in Denmark entrusted by Regulation BEK 1323 with the task to issue GO. The electronic register to export and import them is run by Grexel, a private firm and member of the AIB. The rules in place in Denmark, in particular <b>the EECS rules</b> which are applied, <b>safeguard accurate, reliable and fraud-resistant issuance, transfer and cancellation of GO and the electronic register</b>. There is no indication that energinet.dk or Grexel are acting in violation of those rules. The <b>Danish distribution grid operators are in charge of reading out the meters</b>, although no particular inspections or the like seem to be foreseen. As regards cogeneration plants, they can obtain GO only for the part of the electricity generated from renewable energy – and the production declarations they provide are cross-checked with the data provided in the course of the Danish support scheme, to avoid double-counting, it appears. The Regulation BEK 1323 provides for specific sanctions in case of its violation and further refers to the Danish Criminal Law. Danish GO include <b>all the information required by Article 15 (6) of the Directive</b>, although they can be additionally marked as RECS certificates. Therefore, for the moment and regarding system-related issues, there are <b>no well-founded doubts as regards the accuracy, reliability or veracity of Danish GO</b>, so that according to the assessment done, we have concluded that they can generally be recognized.</p> <p><b>Critical issues</b></p> <p>Strictly speaking, Denmark does not implement Article 3 (9) Directive 2009/72/EC correctly, as it does <b>not present the supplier's mix but a national mix</b>. This may be only a formalistic criticism, as in practice the system seems not to jeopardize the accuracy, reliability and veracity of Danish GO, but it may be raised. Further, Denmark might want to <b>better distinguish between biogenic and non-biogenic waste</b>, rather than putting both sorts together with biomass/biogas.</p> <p><b>Reasons for non-recognition</b></p> <p>none</p>
--	---

### Please note

This summary, published by the German Federal Environment Agency (UBA), was prepared on the basis of the project-related contractual relationships between the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy (BMWi) and Becker Büttner Held (BBH) and the Öko-Institut e.V. The publication or dissemination of the summary to third parties shall not create any legal relationships between BBH and/or the Öko-Institut e.V. and the respective third party; in particular, no legal mandate or consultancy contract shall be established. While all due care has been taken in the preparation of these summaries, neither BBH nor Öko-Institut e.V. assume any guarantee, liability or responsibility as regards their content towards third parties. BBH and Öko-Institut e.V. are not obliged towards third parties to submit any additional information or explanations as regards the content of the summaries.