


Summary of the assessment of national guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) and disclosure systems for the purpose of decisions about the recognition of imported GO

On behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy

Norway	
<div style="display: flex; flex-direction: column; gap: 10px;"> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 60px; height: 40px; margin: 0 auto;"></div> <div style="border: 1px solid black; width: 60px; height: 40px; margin: 0 auto;"></div> <div style="background-color: #00B050; width: 60px; height: 40px; margin: 0 auto;"></div> </div>	<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="width: 70%;"> <p>Introduction</p> <p>The German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy (BMWi) and the German Federal Environment Agency (UBA) are currently assessing general questions on whether guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) from other Member States of the European Union and further states can be recognized in the course of Article 15 of the Directive 2009/28/EC. The evaluation of the legal and practical set-up of the national systems for GO and electricity disclosure is performed by a consortium of external lawyers (Becker Büttner Held Rechtsanwälte (BBH)) and consultants (Öko-Institut e. V.).</p> <p>General</p> <p>As of 08.08.2014, assessment of available information regarding system-related issues does not result in well-founded doubts about accuracy, reliability or veracity of GO issued in and imported from Norway, so that in accordance with Article 15 Directive 2009/28/EC, there seems to be no reason at present for non-recognition of such GO.</p> <p>Specifics</p> <p>Norwegian GO meet all the criteria mentioned in Article 15 Directive 2009/28/EC. Norwegian GO are issued for the standard size of 1 MWh and in practice used for electricity disclosure only. Norway uses – besides the electricity disclosure for renewable energy products, which has to be based on cancelled GO – the national residual mix instead of the overall fuel mix of the supplier company. The national residual mix is calculated by the national competent body for disclosure, the regulator NVE. Disclosure information is not provided with bills and other promotional material, but only published on NVE’s website. Both neglecting of the supplier’s overall fuel mix and the restricted provision only on NVE’s website is not in line with the requirements in Article 3(9) Directive 2009/28/EC. Still, Norwegian regulations seem to suffice to guarantee that no doublecounting of GO is taking place, and thus not to jeopardise the reliability of GO.</p> <p>Renewable energy sources are distinguished from other fuels (namely nuclear and fossil) in electricity disclosure, although this is not clearly regulated by law. The residual mix seems to be robust and is calculated based on the RE-DISS recommendations by NVE, particularly taking into account the usage of GO. GO, which have to be properly cancelled, and the residual mix are the only two ways to prove the origin of renewable electricity. Although the relevant legal provisions allow in principle that GO might be used to meet the binding renewable energy targets imposed by Article 3 Directive 2009/28/EC, subject to approval of the responsible Ministry, this seems not to take place in practice. There is also no indication that GOs have an impact on the calculation of the gross energy consumption.</p> </div> <div style="width: 25%; text-align: center;">  </div> </div>

Summary of the assessment of national guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) and disclosure systems for the purpose of decisions about the recognition of imported GO

On behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy

GO expire **12 months** after the end of the production period of the corresponding energy. Norwegian legal regulations as well as the EECS Rules which are applied by Statnett safeguard that Norwegian GO can be **used only once**. The Norwegian TSO Statnett is the **only competent body** in Norway for GO. The electronic register for handling GO is provided by Grexel, a private company. The rules in place in Norway, in particular **the EECS Rules** which are applied, **safeguard accurate, reliable and fraud-resistant issuance, transfer and cancellation of GO and the application of an electronic register**. There is no indication that Statnett or Grexel are acting in violation of those rules. The **competent body Statnett as TSO is in charge of meter readings** itself, which are the basis for issuing GO. Production devices are **audited when being registered, with a re-audit each five years**. NVE performs audits also for other purposes than for the participation in the GO system, and can conduct on-site audits. As regards production from biomass plants, GO might be issued based on self-declarations of plant operators. However, no thermal biomass plant is operated in Norway so far, thus this rather liberal regulation is of low practical relevance for the time being. Norwegian regulations include **provisions both for correction of erroneous GO and of erroneous or outdated registered data for production devices**. Norwegian regulations provide for sanctions in case of violation, besides general Norwegian Criminal Law.

Norwegian GO include **all the information required by Article 15 (6) Directive 2009/28/EC**. Therefore, for the moment and regarding system-related issues, there are **no well-founded doubts as regards the accuracy, reliability or veracity of Norwegian GO**, so that it can be concluded that they can generally be recognized.

Critical issues

Strictly speaking, Norway does not implement Article 3(9) of Directive 2009/72/EC correctly, as it does **not present the supplier's mix but a national mix**, which is furthermore **not provided with bills, but only on NVE's website**. The calculation procedure itself does not jeopardise the accuracy, reliability or veracity of GO, however. But apart from the strictly formal argumentation, criticism may be raised, as one can doubt that correct information of the fuel mix for "residual mix products" is sufficiently brought to consumers' awareness.

Furthermore, it should be critically observed whether the **legal option for using GO in connection to the national RES targets** is actually being used or not, and ideally abolished with the next revision of relevant legislation.

In case that **biomass** production in Norway emerges, **verification procedures** for such production should be re-assessed.

Reasons for non-recognition

none

Summary of the assessment of national guarantees of origin for electricity produced from renewable sources (GO) and disclosure systems for the purpose of decisions about the recognition of imported GO
On behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy

Please note

This summary, published by the German Federal Environment Agency (UBA), was prepared on the basis of the project-related contractual relationships between the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy (BMWi) and Becker Büttner Held (BBH) and the Öko-Institut e.V. The publication or dissemination of the summary to third parties shall not create any legal relationships between BBH and/or the Öko-Institut e.V. and the respective third party; in particular, no legal mandate or consultancy contract shall be established. While all due care has been taken in the preparation of these summaries, neither BBH nor Öko-Institut e.V. assume any guarantee, liability or responsibility as regards their content towards third parties. BBH and Öko-Institut e.V. are not obliged towards third parties to submit any additional information or explanations as regards the content of the summaries.